



City Council Agenda Report
Meeting Date: November 7, 2017
Department: City Manager

SUBJECT:

AWARD OF LAKE FOREST CIVIC CENTER OWNER'S REPRESENTATIVE SERVICES CONTRACT

RECOMMENDED ACTION(S):

1. Approve the selection of Red Brick Consulting for owner's representative services related to the Lake Forest Civic Center project.
 2. Authorize the Mayor to sign, and City Clerk to attest, the contract with Red Brick Consulting, substantially in the form attached.
-

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY:

In August 2017, staff released a Request for Proposal for Owner's Representative services for the Lake Forest Civic Center project. Traditionally, owner's representatives provide high-level quality assurance reviews for construction activities and deliverables. These services are separate from those of a construction manager and provide additional assurances of quality, cost-control and timely performance of construction activities. For large, complex projects such as the Civic Center, an owner's representative is a means to mitigate risk related to cost (i.e., change orders), quality of work and project delays. An owner's representative can also provide advice when the City must determine a course of action in areas where staff lacks significant expertise.

The City received a total of twelve (12) proposals. After evaluating technical submittals, interviewing firms, and reviewing cost proposals staff recommends awarding a three-year contract to Red Brick Consulting with a total not-to-exceed compensation amount of \$375,170 on a time and materials basis. The Agreement provides for Owner's Representative services for the remainder of the Civic Center project including the design closeout, procurement, construction, and post-construction phases of the project. Based on a review of its qualifications, staff believes Red Brick Consulting offers the best combination of quality and value, bringing extensive experience as an Owner's Representative, quality personnel, and a proven approach to the requested services. The City Attorney's Office reviewed and approved the attached agreement as to form.

BACKGROUND:

The City is engaging in designing a fully integrated Civic Center that will serve as the City's "100-Year Home." The Civic Center project is utilizing a construction manager (fixed fee – not at risk) multi-prime-contract delivery method. The Civic Center is envisioned to include 5 structures - City Hall/ Community Policing Center, Community Center, Senior Center, Council Chamber/ Performing Arts Center, and Parking Deck.

The project groundbreaking began in May 2017 with projected construction completion and move-in in summer of 2019. The Civic Center project is nearing the completion of the Construction Drawings phase, where the design of the Civic Center will be completed. The transition to bid/ procurement and construction phase will begin in early 2018.

The City is currently contracting with the following consultants and contractors for the Civic Center project:

- **Bernards** - Construction Management Services, Cal Green and LEED Commissioning, Site Surveying, and Water Quality Management Implementation
- **Carrier Johnson + Culture** - Architecture and Design Management Services, Civic Center Site Civil Engineering, Water Quality Management Oversight, and Site Utilities
- **ARB Structures** - Parking Deck Structure Design and Build Services
- **Interwest Consulting Group** - Civic Center Building Plan Review and Building Inspection Services

The City is also contracting with the following firms for services associated with Phase 1 of the project, namely the Serrano Summit/ Civic Center Site Rough Grading, Storm Drain, Utilities, Street Design and Construction and Environmental Mitigation:

- **ICF Jones & Stokes** - Environmental, Biological, Paleontological, and Archeological Monitoring Services
- **Carlson Strategic Land Solutions** - Environmental Permit Implementation Services
- **GMU Geotechnical** - Geotechnical Inspection Services
- **Sukut Construction** - Serrano Summit/ Civic Center Site Rough Grading and Retaining Wall Construction
- **Boudreau Pipeline** (Pending City Council Approval – Low Bidder) -

Serrano Summit/ Civic Center Site Storm Drain, Utilities, and Street Construction

- **Anderson Penna Partners** - Serrano Summit/ Civic Center Site Development Engineering Plan Review
- **Michael Baker International** – Civic Center Legal Description

The services provided above are reimbursable through the Developer Agreement with IRWD.

DISCUSSION:

The Civic Center Owner's Representative (OR) services RFP was issued to identify a consultant that will provide high-level quality assurance reviews for the post-design, construction, and post-construction phases of the project. Establishing an Owner's Representative on large-scale construction projects such as the Civic Center project, is a leading industry practice and helps ensure the phases of a construction project are completed with the City's best interests in mind.

The City is contracting with various firms for the Civic Center project. The Owner's Representative services differ from those provided by the City's Construction Management provider, Bernard Bros and other consultants/ vendor firms on the project. The Owner's Representative does not manage project activities or contractors, but rather, monitors and represents the City's interests in areas where the City may not have construction knowledge and expertise. They also provide recommendations to the City on required decisions. In instances where the City may receive differing advice from consultants and contractors, the Owner's Representative would offer guidance to the City in determining a course of action.

Overall, the City expects to rely on the consultant's experience in advising the project and provide the City with "a second set of eyes." The services also provide better assurance that a quality, cost effective project is completed on schedule and within budget. The services will be time and materials-basis; services will be utilized as needs arise throughout the project. The selected consultant is anticipated to attend regular weekly and monthly project meetings.

RFP and Selection Process

On August 15, 2017, staff issued a Request for Proposal ("RFP") for Owner's Representative services for the Lake Forest Civic Center Project. The scope of work included the following services:

- Serve as an advisor for the City for interactions with Civic Center Project Construction Management firm and other project related consultants and contractors
- Review construction drawings, constructability review, specifications, general and special provisions, and cost estimates
- Review project and construction schedule
- Review and advise change orders concerning the necessity for, scope of, and recommended cost of change orders
- Review bids for award of a contract; if requested, Owner's Representative shall become familiar with the City's Code of Ordinances as it relates to the process for contractor selection and make recommendations for qualification and selection criteria
- Review proposed staging, phasing, and site logistic plans
- Recommend modifications, if required, to all reviewed activities and deliverables, for final decision by the City
- Provide construction site observation and high-level quality assurance of construction activities
- Attend regular project meetings as required

Staff began the selection process by posting the RFP on the City's website. Additionally, the RFP was sent to over fifty (50) construction management and consulting firms from the City's vendor lists. Staff held a mandatory pre-proposal meeting on August 22, 2017. During the meeting, staff reviewed the proposed project site, scope of services, and fielded questions. Following the meeting, Staff posted two addenda to the RFP on the City's website on August 24, 2017, and August 29, 2017, to provide additional information requested during the meeting.

Proposals were due on September 11, 2017. The City ultimately received twelve (12) proposals from the following firms by the submittal deadline:

- Abacus Project Management (Newport Beach, CA)
- Alberti + Alberti Architecture (Cardiff by the Sea, CA)
- Aslan Companies Inc. (Irvine, CA)
- Civil Source/ NV5 (Irvine, CA)
- Griffin Structures (Irvine, CA)
- MGAC (Los Angeles, CA)
- PMA Consultants (Long Beach, CA)
- Red Brick Consulting (Dana Point, CA)
- Savills – Studley (Newport Beach, CA)
- Simplus Management Corporation (Cypress, CA)
- Simpson & Simpson Management Consulting (Alhambra, CA)
- Trendzitions (Lake Forest, CA)

The following City Manager-approved selection panel evaluated the submitted proposals:

- Assistant City Manager / Director of Finance
- Director of Public Works
- Director of Development Services

The selection panel scored the proposals based upon the firm’s expertise and past experiences, quality of the firms’ professional personnel, response to the scope of work, allocation of resources, and reference clients and project experiences. In accordance with RFP guidelines, firms must score a minimum average of 70 points on the qualitative evaluation of the technical proposal to advance to the interview portion of the process. The Selection Committee invited the top five (5) scoring firms to the oral presentation/ interview. Each firm was requested to bring to the oral presentation/ interview those team members who would be working directly with City staff on the Civic Center project and provide a presentation on the following interview scoring factors:

- Assigned Personnel Qualifications
- Project and Client Experiences
- Staff Allocation
- Scope of Services

The results of the technical proposal evaluation and interview are displayed in Table 1 below:

Table 1. Technical Proposal Evaluation and Interview Scores

	Technical Proposal				Qualifications Interview				Grand Total
	Rater Score			Sub Total	Rater Score			Sub Total	
	1	2	3		1	2	3		
Firm: Red Brick Consulting									
	73	82	83	238	94	95	96	285	523
Firm: Griffin Structures									
	86	88	91	265	82	85	86	253	518
Firm: Simplus Management Corporation									
	73	85	82	240	91	90	88	269	509
Firm: Civil Source/ NV5									
	84	79	87	250	84	80	85	249	499
Firm: Abacus Project Management									
	90	89	75	254	78	78	80	236	490
Firm: Simpson & Simpson									
	75	82	75	232	N/A				232

Firm: MGAC						
	82	77	72	231	N/A	231
Firm: PMA						
	75	75	64	214	N/A	214
Firm: Aslan Companies						
	73	72	59	204	N/A	204
Firm: Savills Studley						
	50	66	70	186	N/A	186
Firm: Trendzitions						
	50	69	66	185	N/A	185
Firm: Alberti & Alberti						
	50	53	63	166	N/A	166

Staff evaluated cost proposals and Red Brick Consulting came in with the lowest cost proposal. Cost proposals are shown in Table 2 below:

Table 2. Initial Cost Proposals for Top Five (5) Firms

Firm	Cost Proposal
Red Brick Consulting	\$375,170
Abacus Project Management	\$399,810
Griffin Structures	\$420,000
Civil Source/ NV5	\$470,720
Simplus Management Corporation	\$488,520

Staff next compared proposers based upon qualifications and cost proposals as shown in Table 3. On that basis, Red Brick Consulting, Griffin Structures, and Civil Source/ NV5 appear to offer the best combination of qualifications and cost.

Table 3. Qualification and Cost Comparison

	Total Score	% Points Received of Possible 600	Cost Proposal	% over lowest cost proposal
Red Brick Consulting	523	87%	\$375,170	lowest
Griffin Structures	518	86%	\$420,000	+12%
Simplus Management Corporation	509	85%	\$488,520	+30%
Civil Source/ NV5	499	83%	\$470,720	+ 25%
Abacus Project Management	490	82%	\$399,810	+7%

As such, staff conducted reference checks for the top scoring firm that also submitted the lowest cost proposal, Red Brick Consulting. Staff contacted former

clients who had experience with the same members of the team assigned to provide Lake Forest Owner's Representative services. All references provided very positive feedback. Reference sheets are included in Attachment 1.

In comparing the next best combination of qualifications and cost proposals, Griffin Structures scored second highest in total scores with an approximately \$45,000 higher cost proposal than the lowest cost proposal. Abacus earned 82% of the 600 possible points with a cost proposal that was 7% higher than the lowest cost proposal. Griffin Structures is an Orange County firm with a strong track record of successful project delivery. The City has had positive experience working with Griffin as a Construction Manager on the Lake Forest Sports Park and Conceptual Planner in the early stages of the Lake Forest Civic Center project. Abacus is currently serving as Owner Representative for the City of Inglewood on its \$23 million Senior Center project. While the panel felt that both Griffin and Abacus could act as an Owner's Representative, the proposed personnel from both firms were not as strong as Red Brick's proposed personnel in demonstrating a broad breath of experience as an Owner's Representative.

Staff recommends Red Brick Consulting to provide Owner's Representative services for the Civic Center project for the following reasons:

- Experience
 - Red Brick Consulting and assigned team members have extensive experience in successfully providing Owner's Representative services on similar complex construction projects for public sector and private clients. They have served as advisors to owners, contractors, and consultants who build, fund, and/or manage complex construction projects. Past projects of the team members include San Juan Hills High School Sports Facilities, Capistrano High School Performing Arts Theatre, Orange County John Wayne Airport, Loma Linda University Medical Center, and Arcadia City Hall Renovation.
- Presentation of Approach and Sample Experiences
 - During the oral presentations and interviews, the primary assigned resource at each of the top five firms were asked to provide a detailed overview of their approach providing Owner's Representative services for the City and relevant projects similar to the Civic Center project. The purpose of the question was to ensure the primary assigned resource not only has knowledge of Construction Management processes, but also to confirm they understand that the Owner's Representative activities are not to be redundant to the services already provided by the Civic Center Project's

Construction Management firm, Bernards. Red Brick Consulting's primary assigned resource was able to provide several relevant experiences where he worked as an Owner's Representative, a complementary project team member reporting directly to the client in addition to an existing Construction Management firm on the project.

- Personnel Qualifications
 - Red Brick Consulting is proposing team members that have all been leaders in the construction industry. The assigned project resources have each been in the construction industry for 30+ years and have served as an Owner's Representative, Executive Director, Program/ Project Manager, and General Contractor for various large and complex construction projects. The main project team member is an Expert for Cost and Schedule and Standard of Care for Grading and Contracting, and also holds a California Contractors Class A Civil Engineering License.
- Allocation of Personnel Relative to Civic Center Construction Site
 - Red Brick Consulting is located locally in Dana Point, CA. The main project team member providing Owner's Representative Services lives locally in Orange County as well as his primary back-up team member.
- Best combination of qualifications and cost of services.
 - The City has a commitment to the community to utilize a conservative fiscal approach for the Civic Center Project. Red Brick Consulting is the top scoring firm and has also proposed the lowest overall cost proposal. Staff believes the services proposed by Red Brick Consulting offers the City the best combination of qualifications and cost of services.

FISCAL IMPACT:

The agreement's total compensation is for a not-to-exceed amount of \$375,170 on a time and materials basis. There are sufficient funds budgeted in the 2017-2019 Capital Improvement Projects Budget for the recommended action.

ATTACHMENTS:

- References
- Contract with Red Brick Consulting

Submitted By: Keith D. Neves, Assistant City Manager / Director of Finance
Thomas E. Wheeler, Director of Public Works

Approved By: Debra Rose, City Manager